The Japanese Public Pension System: What Went Wrong and What Reform Measures We Have

by

Noriyuki Takayama

Professor of Economics, Hitotsubashi University
takayama@ier.hit-u.ac.jp
http://www.ier.hit-u.ac.jp/~takayama/

International Conference on Japan and Italy: Economic Performances and Policies Compared, Bocconi University, Milano, 9-10 October 2003
Organization

- Demography
- Basic Facts:
  Identifying Main JPN Problems
- Future Policy Options
- Concluding Remarks

- 2-tier Benefits
- Contributions
- The Biggest Business
Two-tier Benefits (DB)

- Basic Flat-rate Benefits (PM, PP)
  
  66,400 yen = Euro 516

- Earnings-related Benefits (40Yrs)
  
  28.5% of Career Average Monthly Real Earnings

- Replacement Rate (One-earner Couple)
  
  Around 60% Net (230,000 yen = Euro 1,780)

- CPI Indexation
Contributions/Transfer from GR

- Contributions
  13.58% of Annual Wages
  13,300 yen = Euro 103 (PM, PP)

- Subsidy from General Revenue
  1/3 of Flat-rate Basic Benefits

- Mainly PAYG, but
  with Partial Prefunding
The Biggest Business in Japan

- **Aggregate SS Pension Benefits**
  
  44 tr. Yen = Euro 341 billion in 2003
  
  (12% of National Income)

  cf. The Automobile Industry
  
  40 tr. Yen (Domestic Output in 2000)

- **Rapidly Growing**
Demography

- TFR
- Total No. of Populations
- Proportion of 65+
Trends in the Total Fertility Rate of Japan

Actual and Projected Population of Japan

Proportion of the Elderly (+65) in Japan

Year 2003
19.0% (Japan)


High variant
Medium variant
Low variant
Basic Facts

- Deficit in Current Account
- Balance Sheet:
  - Huge Excess Liabilities
- SS Pension Contributions:
  - Heavy Burdens Outstanding
- Too Much Income Transfers between Generations
- Increasing Drop-out
Current Account of the KNH

(trillion yen)

- 1999: 3.95
- 2000: 2.08
- 2001: -0.70
- 2002: -0.61
- 2003: -2.84

(YEAR)
Balance Sheet of the KNH
(as at the 31st MAR 2000)

Assets Liabilities

- Excess Liabilities: 530 tr. yen

Contributions
Transfers (GR)
F. Reserve

2150
1170
170
280

(trillion yen)
Balance Sheet of the KNH (Part 1)

(as at the 31st MAR 2000)

Pension Liabilities Accrued from FUTURE Contributions

Excess Liabilities: 80 tr. yen

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assets</th>
<th>Liabilities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1170</td>
<td>1,430</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>180</td>
<td>Transfers  (GR)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Contributions
Balance Sheet of the KNH (Part 2)

(Part 2)

(as at the 31st MAR 2000)

Pension Liabilities Accrued from PAST Contributions

Excess Liabilities: 450 tr. yen

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assets</th>
<th>Liabilities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>100 Transfers (GR)</td>
<td>720</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>170 F. Reserve</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Which Is More, SS Contributions or Tax Revenues?
FY 2003 National Budget, Japan

SS Contributions (Trillion Yen): 55.6
Tax (Central Gov.t): 43.9
Main Income Sources of Japan’s Central Government
FY 2003 National Budget, Japan

(trillion yen)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Consumption Tax</td>
<td>11.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Income Tax</td>
<td>13.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SS Pension Contributions</td>
<td>29.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SS Health Care Contributions</td>
<td>17.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Income Tax</td>
<td>9.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Per-capita Income by Age in Japan

SS pension benefits are the major source of retirement income

SS Pension Benefits: 78%
Interest and Dividends: 5%
Wages and Salaries: 6%
Others: 11%
Median income: 3.38 million yen

Source: The 1989 NSFIE (elderly couples: median income group)
Drop-out from SS Pensions (Non-employees)
Delinquency in Paying Pension Contributions

%  


YEAR

37.2
Future Policy Options

- Is NDC the Answer?
- Other Policy Concerns
Is NDC the Answer?

- How Helpful?
- Any JPN-specific Problems Remaining?
- Politically Feasible?
Strengthening Incentive-Compatibility

- Direct Link between Contributions and Pension Benefits
  
  “Every Penny Counts”

- Increased Credibility
JPN-specific Problems

- Income Reporting Reliable?
- Legacy Pensions
  - Huge Excess Liabilities
- Reducing EL:
  - Several Options
Option 1: Reducing Benefits

- Deflation-Indexing
- A Clawback System
- “Macroeconomic Indexation”
- Increasing the NRA to 67
- Deducting Contributions for Health Care
- More Taxes on Benefits
Option 2: Increasing Contributions

- Incentive-compatible?
  - What Matters is Taste of Pie
- Penalties on Employment
  - Non-neutral & Regressive
- Income Tax Revenues
Option 3: Increasing Subsidies

- **Where to Go:**
  
  Flat-rate Basic Benefits (1/3 or 1/2) or Guaranteed Pensions or Legacy Pensions?

- **What Funding Source:**
  
  Consumption Tax or Income Tax or Cutting Other Public Expenditure?
Other Policy Concerns

- Relaxing the Earnings-test
- Earnings-split between Husband & Wife
- Extending Coverage to Part-time Employees
- Non-Employees:
  - Shift to Income-related Contributions
- Strengthening Private Initiatives
Concluding Remarks

- Options Vary among Different Ministries
- No Concrete Proposals, Yet, from Political Parties
- Government reform plan may be fixed by the end of DEC 2003