Title: 'My Dear Sanshiro': Edward Carpenter and His Japanese Disciple
Author(s): Tsuzuki, Chushichi
Citation: Hitotsubashi journal of social studies, 6(1): 1-9
Issue Date: 1972-11
Type: Departmental Bulletin Paper
URL: http://doi.org/10.15057/8479
A curious fate awaited the reputation of Edward Carpenter, the poet of what might be called democratic idealism and one of the early crusaders of English socialism, sometimes known as the author of pioneering works on the then forbidden subject of sex and love. It is true, as E.M. Forster had predicted, he failed to attain earthly immortality either as a man of letter or as a scientist or philosopher. Indeed, he appears to have been relegated to the host of forgotten thinkers. Yet those who knew him, both Englishmen and foreigners, were unanimous in acknowledging him as the main source for them of socialist inspiration. His power of persuasion was profoundly personal, and his influence, which was not of the kind that would lead to the formation of a school or a sect, was truly seminal. This was perhaps not so with other champions of English socialism such as Hyndman, Morris and Keir Hardie, though these figured more prominently in history. Carpenter was not the high mountain that towered above ordinary souls but the deep water that engulfed all comers. Blatchford was probably right when he wrote that 'the personality of Edward Carpenter was more vital and arresting than his poem.'

We learn from the Carpenter Collection now deposited at the Sheffield City Library that Carpenter kept extensive correspondence with a number of foreign admirers of his works including several Japanese socialists and poets. This article is an attempt to trace and evaluate his influence on one of the socialist pioneers in Japan, Sanshiro Ishikawa, who developed anarchism of his own.

In the history of Japanese socialism, Carpenter did figure prominently, for he was perhaps the first English socialist, apart from the doubtful case of Thomas More, who appeared in the motley collection of Europeans and Americans who with vague socialist ideals inspired the first generations of Japanese radicals and democrats. Carpenter's *Civilisation: Its Cause and Cure* was translated into Japanese in 1893 in a series of 'books for the common people' issued by the Minyusha, 'the Friends of the People'.

In the years of rapid industrialisation after the Sino-Japanese war, Japanese liberals and democrats began to take a more definite interest in the problems of socialism and labour. Early in the 20th century, a handful of anti-war socialists attracted attention by denouncing the war against Russia in their organ the *Heimin-shinbun* (*Plebs Newspaper*), and managed to set up the Japanese Socialist Party after the war. The party soon split between social democrats and direct actionists, and shortly afterwards was suppressed by the government.

There was one Heimin leader who refused to join the Socialist party. This was Sanshiro...
Ishikawa who retained much of his earlier faith in Christianity or the religious or spiritual ideal of human brotherhood. In due time he came under the spell of Edward Carpenter, from whom, he later acknowledged, he learned more for his libertarian socialism than from Kropotkin or Bakunin.

When Ishikawa declined an invitation to join the Socialist party, he published a statement declaring that a political party would require conformism whereas missionary work, in which he believed, needed freedom. He was however persuaded to join the editorial staff of the new daily Heimin-shinbun, organ of the Socialist party, and thus began his struggle with the authoritarian government. The paper itself, after three months’ brave existence, was suppressed, and Ishikawa, editor-in-chief, was sent to prison in April 1907 for several offending articles including a report of the conference at which regret was expressed for the use of the troops against the strikers at the Ashio Copper Mine.

In prison Ishikawa found time to tackle socialist literature. ‘I first read Ely and Kirkup, and proceeded to Marx’s Capital,’ he wrote in his autobiography: ‘There were many interesting points in that book, but what dull person Marx was! I was simply astonished. I found him verbose and too much grumbling... Compared to Capital, I read Kropotkin’s Conquest of Bread with great pleasure. I went through it at a stretch. In spite of the fact that it was a most agreeable reading, however, I could not fully trust it. I found Kropotkin over-optimistic both in his argument on the path of revolution and in his general view of life. Edward Carpenter whose books I happened to read at the time, strangely enough, solved all the doubts I had had before.’ His study of Carpenter at the time, however, did not go beyond Bliss’s Encyclopedia of Social Reform and Sidney Webb’s account of English Socialism. At any rate he came out of prison with a great quantity of notes and manuscripts which were published in two books (though suppressed by the government): The Light of Nothingness (1908) and History of the Western Social Movement (1913).

In the first book Ishikawa dealt with the problem of religion and life, freely quoting from the Buddhist literature and Chinese classics as well as the Bible. Although there was no reference to Carpenter, the book was largely Carpenterian, and showed that his own religiously inclined socialism had much in common with Carpenter’s. The Christian Abba, wrote Ishikawa, was ‘the universe reflected in one’s own nothingness, the universe seen through the eyes of one’s true self’. From the point of view of this larger self, social cooperation and individual autonomy, the Marxian concept of class war and Kropotkin’s idea of mutual help only represented different aspects of the same evolution of humanity, and the attainment of liberty and equality that constituted democracy would depend upon the realisation of true self.

Carpenter was known among Japanese socialists at the time mainly for his enlightened views on sex. Toshihiko Sakai, Ishikawa’s colleague on the Heimin-shinbun, published a free translation of sections of Carpenter’s Love’s Coming of Age. Ishikawa himself was an advocate of free love, though he was to some extent making a virtue of necessity. It was not before he came out of prison in 1908 that he studied Carpenter in earnest. Carpenter’s

---

7 See Chokugen, 30 April, 7 May 1905, and also Sakai, Fujinmondai (The Women Question), 1907.
Civilisation, said Ishikawa, 'cut off at one stroke the sores which had worried me for many years... I had come to realise that the Marxian doctrine of historical necessity was sheer nonsense for the cause of human emancipation, and now felt that I had been rescued from an impasse by Carpenter's specific view of life. He explained various phases of the social life of men and its evolution in terms of split of one's self, regarded internal unity of a man as inseparable from his external unity, and concluded that a true democratic life, anarchistic, communistic and aristocratic, would be achieved by restoration of cosmic consciousness.

Ishikawa now sought Carpenter's acquaintance. His first letter to the English sage now existant in the Carpenter Collection is dated December 14, 1909 and marked in Carpenter's hand 'From a Jap Communist': 'My dear Mr. Edward Carpenter, I have longed very much to write to you, since I read your "Civilisation: Its Cause and Cure" and "Love's Coming of Age" and the late Crosby's "Edward Carpenter: Poet and Prophet"... I am a Japanese communist, called generally "Socialist". I have been [propagating] communism for about seven years in Japan, including one year in the movement of Christian Socialism, which I named especially [for] it, and including 13 months of the penance-life in the prison, which our despotic government sentenced for me, charging that my newspaper disturbed the social order. Now, as I was very long [dissatisfied with] the mere mechanical materialistic Socialism and the mere parliamentary movement, it has made me feel as if I had met an oasis, that I read the books mentioned above and that I found your prophet-like figure. My admirable Carpenter! I hope to proclaim your gospel over our country... Present condition of our Japanese people is that which you sang "to the waking fever of remorse; to the long Cadaverous vigil of physical pain" in the "Towards Democracy." I believe that your excellent works will be a great leading light especially for the present people of Japan, who are wandering [through] the dark wild desert.'

Carpenter's reply, together with his other letters to Ishikawa, is now preserved among the papers left by Ishikawa to his daughter:

'Dear friend Ishikawa Sanshiro,

Do please forgive me for being so long in replying to your hearty letter. How sweet it is to hear from you all across the world, & to know that the same thoughts are moving you far away in the Land of the Rising Sun, as here on the shores of the Atlantic!—the same inspirations & hopes of a newer truer human society, and the same struggles & battles against the forces of reaction & tyranny.

I think I remember about you or some of your comrades being sent to prison on account of publishing a Socialist paper. Well I daresay you do not regret it. These movements have to go very slowly, & chiefly by spreading new ideas—which take a long time to germinate in people's minds! So you must not expect results all at once. At the same time good work is not thrown away, and I think one need not fear about its having its result in time.

The development of Commercialism in Japan must be very strange, & very puzzling to the people—whose traditions have been so different—and it is difficult to know what will be the result. You are welcome, dear comrade, to translate anything of mine...'

Ishikawa had assisted Mrs. Hideko Fukuda, the celebrated heroine of the Jiyu-Minken...
(Liberty and People's Right) Movement, in launching the Sekai Fujin or World Women, the first Socialist paper devoted to the cause of the emancipation of women in Japan. He became its editor and publisher, and was once more indicted for offending articles including his own entitled 'The Graveyard'. ‘I have to be sent to prison to-morrow’, he wrote to Carpenter: ‘because I am sentenced four months imprisonment and sixty Yen (more than six pounds) fine on publishing a socialistic paper. In spite of my article [being] pretty peaceful, it seems to me, our despotist reactionary government felt it to be very dangerous...’12 ‘Just a line to cheer you in prison’, wrote Carpenter in reply: ‘—though you will be nearly coming out when this reaches you. I received your letter of 27 March with much pleasure. You were to go to prison next day. They seem to be very severe & despotic in Japan, when one cannot even publish Civilisation: its cause & cure there. But your country men are too sensible to bear this sort of treatment for very long. I suppose it is patriotism which is so strong in the nation just now, and which forms an excuse for anti-socialism. King Edward VIIth’s death is causing a great wave of patriotism here; but the future of mankind is leading us beyond patriotism to humanity.’13 As it turned out, the ‘Graveyard’ article saved Ishikawa’s life, for it was while he was in prison that the government started arresting anarchists and anarchist sympathisers, 26 altogether allegedly involved in a plot against the life of the emperor Meiji, and the treason trial that followed resulted in the execution of twelve of them including Denjiro Kotoku. Shortly after his own release, Ishikawa wrote to Carpenter: ‘I came out [of] prison 28th July. In the prison I heard that your kind letter had been received at my house, but the authority [did] not [permit] delivery [to] me even [of] the select translation of it... After one month in the Tokyo prison, I [was] escorted to the Chiba prison, where I met six comrades who all were imprisoned two years ago. There the solitary system is practised. As you said in your “Prisons, Police, and Punishment” the solitary system is a “starvation-of-body-and-mind system” and “truly these prisons are outwardly clean and decent and orderly: but inwardly what are they but whitened sepulchres full of dead men’s bones?” True! True! I experienced it.’14 Ishikawa, out of prison, remained a suspect, though the prosecution failed to implicate him in the rigged trial of the revolutionaries. He now informed Carpenter of the dreary outcome of the trial, saying that ‘our stubborn government has practised its bigotry despotism upon Free thinkers, Socialists, and Anarchists.’15

In the meantime, in 1912 Ishikawa’s Carpenter: Poet and Prophet came out with a preface by Kenjiro Tokutomi. The author described his subject as a man of synthesis who would throw a new light on the world of ‘chaos and darkness’, chaos in socialism and darkness in religion. ‘In spite of his penetrating views’, he wrote: ‘Carpenter may not as widely be known as is Tolstoy or Kropotkin. He is not as dramatic in his action as was Marx or Bakunin. Yet in his taste and knowledge which are wide and manifold, in his observation which is sharp and profound, in his criticism which is truly perspicacious, in his argument which is just and fair, he does not fall behind the first two thinkers. In his action or “Propaganda by deed” in a profound sense he even surpasses the other two.’ If he was unduly
neglected, the negligence can be explained after all by the fact that his life has far transcended
the philistine world around him, and also by the circumstance that he was born in such a
tranquil country of common-sense as England.16

Ishikawa sent a copy of his book to Carpenter, saying that ‘I wrote it with my whole
heart.’17 The Englishman thanked him for the book, and seeing that it was after all allowed
to come out, added: ‘I hope the Socialist cause is going better in Japan now, and that your
Government is abandoning the foolish policy of persecution.’18 It is true, as Ishikawa him-
self said, his book made ‘a deep impression [on] our thought-world.’19 Yet in the atmos-
phere of open hostility to socialists and anarchists after the treason trial, Ishikawa found it
impossible to obtain a decent job. He was envious of his English master having a plot of
land to cultivate. He even tried his hand at hawking bamboo pipes or edges of wooden
sandals. He was finally persuaded by a Chinese lady and the Belgian vice-consul at Yokohama
named Gobert to go abroad. He was refused a passport, but left Yokohama on 1
March 1931 on board a French liner as an attendant for the wife of the Belgian consul who
was leaving the country. Indeed, he was a political exile.

Ishikawa arrived at Marseilles on 7th April and proceeded by train to Brussels. He
felt that nature in Europe as he saw it in France was in decay and European civilisation as he
observed it in Brussels was in decadence.20 Shortly after his arrival in the Belgian captial,
he wrote to Carpenter: ‘...I will stay here for some time. Though I am hoping heartily
to call on you as soon as I can, I cannot [do so] [mainly because] I am very poor. As to
the friendship in the life of the ancient people of Japan I will inform you by and by. Before
I left Japan I [asked] a friend to study about this subject ...’21 Carpenter had asked him
to send any information available on the subject as he believed that ‘warm friendships be-
tween men may have very good results in the life of the people—and something about the
Samurai may help to show this.’ Sublimation of homosexuality formed one peculiarity of
Carpenter’s superb concept of human brotherhood, as was shown by his Intermediate Sex
published in 1908.

In November 1913 he crossed the Channel and met Carpenter in London. He described
the city as resembling the scene of a fire with its great smoke and stifling odour, with its people,
carriages, and automobiles running to and fro in disorder.22 Carpenter himself impressed
his visitor with a remark on the dirt and smell of the great city when Ishikawa called on him
at his sister’s house in London. Two days later Ishikawa travelled up to Millthorpe near
Sheffield, where his host had a cottage at the edge of the Derbyshire Moor.

He was given a full Carpenterian reception: he was taken to a village club in the evening,
accompanied Carpenter in a morning walk, and listened to him playing piano and to his friend
George Merrill singing ‘England Arise’. He also found time to have a talk with his host
on such topics as Kropotkin, Oscar Wilde, Lafcadio Hearn, Shintoism, Zen Buddhism and
Saikaku Ihara, whose novels dealing with homosexuals Carpenter had read in a German
translation. There Ishikawa met Henry Salt, chairman of the Humanitarian League, and his

16 Ishikawa, Carpenter, etc. pp. 9-10.
17 Ishikawa to Carpenter, 8 Macrh 1912.
18 Carpenter to Ishikawa, 6 April 1912.
19 Ishikawa to Carpenter, 22 May 1912.
21 Ishikawa to Carpenter, 11 April 1913.
22 Ishikawa, Horo-Hachinen-ki, p. 129.
wife. He was ‘stunned’, as he said, by the kindness of Englishmen, particularly those around Carpenter. Their ‘purity of mind’, he wrote, exhibited a remarkable contrast to the dirt of London street.  

As a helpless exile, however, he suffered from pecuniary trouble which soon became acute. Back in Brussels, he wrote to Carpenter: ‘I received a letter from Dr. Baty [a member of the Humanitarian League whom Ishikawa had met in London]. In the letter he advises me to write to “the Berlitz school”, “Misses Flowerdew, translators” and “The Cosmopolis”. But I am too . . . timid to write myself to them, and also I think it will be unsuccessful . . . [Couldn’t] you find some work for me in the sandal factory? Or in some market garden? Unexpectedly I am perplexed now, because my friend, who gave me living expenses continuously till to-day, became unable [to do so], [as] he . . . lost his position [while] I was in England . . . [It] is very expensive, and . . . very hard for me in present condition to return to Japan. I find myself in an inextricable difficulty’. Carpenter said in reply that ‘at this time of year neither market gardening or sandal making offer any chance of employment’, though these were the two types of occupation by which, it was widely supposed, Carpenter sought personally to evade the effects of modern civilisation. He at once sent to Brussels money order which helped Ishikawa to eke out till the beginning of 1914. It was arranged at the same time that a certain Clement, a London banker, who married Carpenter’s niece, was to find accommodation for Ishikawa in his own house at Ruislip, a western suburb of London. There Ishikawa was to spend the following few months, and correspondence between him and Carpenter in this period shows what great efforts the English socialist and his friends made to find a job for the helpless Japanese.

Their attempts, however, proved unsuccessful, and Ishikawa thought seriously of returning to Japan. He had taken a certain Kitsui with him on one of his visits to Carpenter in London, and said in a letter to him that this man would help him if he should decide to go back to Japan, though ‘he is only an attendant of a prince, and so he is only able to help secretly a socialist [like] me. He asked [on my behalf] the Japanese consul to [grant] a passport. But the consul-general previously knew my arrival in England, and refused . . . So I am obliged to take [a] European ship . . . I have no plan. I have to leave myself to the course of events. I am not yet sure even that I can go back to Japan. I think that my Belgian friend who is now travelling to South America will help me.’

It was his Belgian friend, Paul Reclus, nephew of the famous geographer and anarchist Elisée Reclus, and himself a geographer, who rescued him out of the difficulties he had met in London. Carpenter, himself at his wit’s end, had advised him to accept Reclus’s offer and go to Brussels. ‘The longer you can stay in Europe the more satisfactory it will be for you.’ He also sent another cheque for £2.

All this time Ishikawa worked as a correspondent for a Japanese newspaper. In an article he observed that England was in critical condition with all her sores, Ireland, Suffragette violence, Larkinism and the great South African strike, bursting at once and discharging all the filth and pus to clear herself. He saw a suffragette demonstration at Trafalgar Square:

11 Ibid., p. 135.
14 Ishikawa to Carpenter, 25 Nov. 1913.
15 Carpenter to Ishikawa, 27 Nov. 1913.
16 Ishikawa to Carpenter, 4 Dec. 1913.
17 Ishikawa to Carpenter, 2 March 1914.
18 Carpenter to Ishikawa, 7 April 1914.
and described how bravely Miss Petersen fought single-handed with 50 or 60 'giant' policemen. His distrust of parliamentary politics which he had developed in Japan was further strengthened by what he saw in England during the great social unrest on the eve of the European war. ‘Before I came to England, I had admired political freedom in this country, and I still admire freedom in creed, thought and expression they enjoy here. But I regret to learn that wealth, taking advantage of this freedom, have corrupted men, destroyed justice, engrossed political regimes, ruled political parties, vitiated elections, and corrupted members of parliament themselves.’ Parliamentary politics were spoiled by the front bench of a party monopolising its funds and dictating to the rank-and-files. With the Ulster Unionists, the last prestige of the Parliament fell to the ground. ‘I feel that all the troubles afflicting English society can be reduced to a single cause: parliamentary and party politics, and that the English people are striving, consciously or unconsciously, to free themselves from this institution, and commercialism and capitalism that support it.’

In Brussels Ishikawa stayed with the Reclus family and obtained a job as a decorator. Shortly after the outbreak of the war he sent a hurried note to Carpenter, telling him that he could not continue his work if the Germans should invade. On 20 August the Germans entered the city, but Ishikawa stayed on till early next year when he moved to Paris by way of London. He settled at Liancourt north of Paris, and after 16 months’ adventurous life as the keeper of a vacated house not far from the front (which belonged to a friend of Reclus’s), he moved on to Domme in Central France to join Madame Reclus who had gone there before. Part of the reason for his departure from Liancourt, as he explained, was his disagreement with the owner of the house who had become an advocate for an immediate peace. Just as so many anarchists, Kropotkin and Reclus among others, upheld the cause of the Allied Powers, Ishikawa, who had been opposed to the Japanese war against Russia, was now in favour of fighting against the German invaders.

All this time, he kept Carpenter informed of his own movement. The Englishman asked him if he was helping in a hospital at Liancourt, for, he said, ‘George and I might come out. We want some work of that kind.’ In 1916 he received Carpenter’s ‘new and beautiful book’, probably his autobiography *My Days and Dreams* published in that year. ‘After [having] read [it till the] midnight, I . . . kept it in my bed until this morning. I wish to translate it into Japanese, though I have not much time at present. But I think that there will be many other translators now in Japan, because your name is . . . celebrated there and many young people are aspiring to study about you. Now the people has begun to [make money] by your name and books. I think the war will not [last] very long time. But the arrangement of international relations after the war will be extremely difficult and it is very important for future peace.’ Three months later he received ‘a very interesting pamphlet’, probably *Never Again*, a powerful indictment of the ‘insane war’ by Carpenter: ‘Yes I have been much occupied in the garden, but now I am to have a little time to read and write. I should like to translate your article immediately’. He did translate it while he was at Domme, and his version was published as a new chapter in the revised edition of his

---

30 Ishikawa to Carpenter, 15 Aug. 1914.
31 Carpenter to Ishikawa, 10 June 1915.
32 Ishikawa to Carpenter, 10 July 1916.
33 Ishikawa to Carpenter, 10 August 1916.
study of Carpenter. Carpenter sent yet another book to Domme—*Towards Industrial Freedom*. ‘I have read about half of the book’, wrote Ishikawa: ‘How interesting it is! Among all its interesting chapters, I have found the “Industry as an art” and the “beauty in everyday life” deep [and significant] especially because I have just been feeling in my everyday life as a gardener that agriculture is and must be a true art. In gardening and agriculture we can properly cooperate with nature in her artistic and creative work’.

From Domme Ishikawa sent letters to a Japanese newspaper on Verdun, Syndicalism, proposals for a League of Nations and other topics of the day. Shortly after the armistice he travelled to Morocco as a helper for Madame Reclus who was ill, and paid his last visit to Millthorpe in August 1920. At this Arcadia of the English north he plunged into a brook in the pleasant woods in a state of nature as his host had used to do, and sat in the hut where *Towards Democracy* had been created. He spent one of his last days in Europe with Carpenter in London where he embarked for Japan in the middle of September.

After eight years’ absence he found his country more confused and disorderly than ever. The whole city of Tokyo appeared to him to be ‘a vast dust-bin’. ‘In less than a week I became weary of this sick nation’, he wrote: ‘Her “oversea expansion” or her brandishing of “national prestige” is nothing but a form of convulsions due to her greedy eating of civilisation dishes called capitalism.’ His analysis of Japanese ‘civilisation’ was certainly Carpenterian, but with his European experiences behind him he was now able to emphasize traditional elements in it. ‘The Japanese are prone to unity in nothingness, while the westerners are fond of unity in existence’, he said. ‘It is from the dreary world of nothingness that a Hibiya Park riot or a Rice Riot suddenly breaks out’. Unity in Carpenter was positive and formed culmination of the historical process of human evolution, whereas unity which Ishikawa saw among the Japanese was negative and otherworldly, and violent. ‘Free expression is to alleviate violence’, he added: ‘The Japanese who have not been accustomed to free expression and do not esteem its value, jump from silence into violence.’

In 1921 Ishikawa gave a lecture at the Imperial University, entitled ‘Domin-Seikatsu (Land-People-Life) or Democracy’, by which he meant return to the land of the people who had originally sprung from the land, and this, he held, was Carpenter’s view of democracy. It is true that Carpenter appreciated Thoreau’s pursuit for natural simplicity and attached much importance to the cultivation of land in the form of small holding and co-operation, but free, creative life for Carpenter was not necessarily rustic. He dreamed of industrial villages and garden cities but these did not mean return to the land as such, and his ideas on social reconstruction were more or less in the line of anarcho-syndicalism or guild socialism. Ishikawa himself became an advocate both of peasant co-operation and of syndicalism, but he tended to emphasize agriculture or what he called ‘the landed life’ of idyllic democracy. Carpenter the farmer as he found him at Millthorpe thus exerted decisive influence on his later development.

The Japanese Fabian Society, formed in 1924 by Ishikawa and his friends, was meant to embrace all tendencies and schools in the socialist movement in order to invigorate it.

---

34 Ishikawa, *Carpenter and his Philosophy* (1921), chapter 12.
35 Ishikawa to Carpenter, 9 Nov. 1917. The Book was translated into Japanese by Kozuo Kato in 1920.
So far it was Carpenterian, thought it had only an ephemeral existence and was wound up by the end of the year. In 1927 Ishikawa moved to a village west of Tokyo and began to cultivate a plot of land—-a Tokyo Millthorpe. In 1930, the year after Carpenter's death, *Dynamique*, a literary journal founded by Ishikawa, issued a special number for the memory of Carpenter in which appeared an ode by a young poet who regarded Carpenter as the muse who inspired a romantic and eternal life. The poet committed suicide shortly afterwards.

Perhaps the last specimen of the Carpenterian peculiarity as far as Japanese socialism was concerned was Ishikawa's treatment of nudity as the symbol of natural freedom in his anarchist utopia written after the Second World War. In fact, little remained by this time of the spirit of Carpenter's own revolt against Victorian values as it was inherited by Ishikawa and his circle. Whatever remained was submerged under the traditional attitude towards life and death, or what Ishikawa might have called romanticism of nothingness, while conformism of all sorts, another traditional characteristic of the nation, killed toleration, the essence of Carpenter's philosophy.

---